DOCKET NUMBER T-36504 - LOUISIANA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION VS. ADAIR MOVERS LLC. IN RE: **ALLEGED** VIOLATION OF LA. R.S. 45:161 THROUGH 180.1, BY ENGAGING IN ACTIVITIES RELATED TO MOVING HOUSEHOLD GOODS PRIOR TO COMPLYING WITH THE REQUIREMENTS OF LA. R.S. 45:164 (E) AND GENERAL ORDER DATED MARCH 16, 2021 AND FOR FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE REQUIREMENTS OF GENERAL ORDER DATED APRIL 3, 2008 AS AMENDED.

DATE OF HEARING: MAY 4, 2023

## ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE MELISSA FREY

**WITNESSES: PAGE NUMBER** 

Tammy Burl on behalf of Louisiana Public Service Commission

Direct Examination by Tanika Starks 2 - 27

Redirect Examination by Tanika Starks 31 - 32

- 1 DOCKET NUMBER T-36504 LOUISIANA PUBLIC SERVICE
- 2 COMMISSION VS. ADAIR MOVERS LLC. IN RE: ALLEGED
- 3 VIOLATION OF LA. R.S. 45:161 THROUGH 180.1, BY ENGAGING IN
- 4 ACTIVITIES RELATED TO MOVING HOUSEHOLD GOODS PRIOR TO
- 5 COMPLYING WITH THE REQUIREMENTS OF LA. R.S. 45:164 (E) AND
- 6 GENERAL ORDER DATED MARCH 16, 2021 AND FOR FAILURE TO
- 7 COMPLY WITH THE REQUIREMENTS OF GENERAL ORDER DATED
- **8 APRIL 3, 2008 AS AMENDED.**
- 9 **ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE MELISSA FREY:** The next matter, the last
- matter we have on the docket this morning is Docket Number T-36504 Louisiana
- Public Service Commission versus Adair Movers LLC. In re: Alleged violation of
- Louisiana Revised Statute 45:161 through 180.1, by engaging in activities related
- to moving household goods prior to complying with the requirements of Louisiana
- Revised Statute 45:164(E) and General Order dated March 16, 2021 and for failure
- to comply with the requirements of General Order dated April 3, 2008 as amended.
- 16 Would the parties present please make your appearances for the record?
- 17 **MS. TANIKA STARKS:** Tanika Starks on behalf of Staff.
- 18 **JUDGE FREY:** Let the record reflect that there is no one present in the courtroom
- this morning on behalf of Adair Movers LLC. Is the Staff prepared to move forward
- with this matter this morning?
- 21 **MS. STARKS:** Yes, Your Honor.
- JUDGE FREY: Thank you, Ms. Starks. You may proceed.

- MS. STARKS: Your Honor, Commission Staff is prepared to prove through both
- 2 documentary and testimonial evidence that the carrier cited in this docket, Adair
- 3 Movers LLC, violated Louisiana Revised Statute 45:161 through 180.1 by
- 4 engaging in activities related to moving household goods prior to complying with
- 5 the requirements of Louisiana Revised Statute 45:164(E) and General Order dated
- 6 March 16, 2021 and for the failure to comply with the requirements of General
- Order dated April 3, 2008 as amended. Your Honor, as a result of that violation, at
- 8 the conclusion of this hearing, Staff is going to request that the carrier be found
- 9 guilty of all violations, and that a fine be assessed to the carrier as well as a \$25
- citation fee. Your Honor, at this time, we call our first witness, Ms. Tammy Burl.
- 11 Tammy Burl came forth as a witness; and, after having been duly sworn,
- 12 **testified as follows:**
- 13 **DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. TANIKA STARKS**
- 14 **MS. STARKS:** Good morning, Ms. Burl.
- 15 **MS. TAMMY BURL:** Good morning.
- MS. STARKS: Can you state your name and business address for the record?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** Tammy Burl, 602 North 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70802.
- 18 **MS. STARKS:** And where are you employed, Ms. Burl?
- 19 **MS. BURL:** The Louisiana Public Service Commission, Transportation Division.
- 20 MS. STARKS: And what is your job title at the Louisiana Public Service
- 21 Commission?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** I am the Transportation Administrator.

- MS. STARKS: And what are some of those duties as the Transportation
- 2 Administrator?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** I oversee the day-to-day operations of the division, which includes
- 4 filings of insurance, registration of motor carriers, investigations, complaints,
- 5 annual reports.
- 6 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And regarding complaints, who do you usually receive the
- 7 complaints from and for what reasons?
- 8 **MS. BURL:** Typically we receive complaints either from consumers that have
- 9 filed a complaint. Sometimes we receive complaints from other regulated motor
- carriers about the industry, so we get various complaints from different people.
- 11 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And is it your duty to review those complaints when they
- come in?
- 13 MS. BURL: Yes. I review them, but typically I will pass them over to a Staff
- member to start the initial investigation.
- 15 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And are you familiar with Louisiana Revised Statute Title
- 16 45?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 18 **MS. STARKS:** And does that Title authorizes the Commission to regulate and
- create and enforce rules upon common carriers of household goods?
- 20 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 21 **MS. STARKS:** And does that section also require intrastate household goods
- 22 movers to apply for and secure a common carrier certificate with the LPSC?
- 23 **MS. BURL:** Yes.

- 1 MS. STARKS: And has the Commission adopted any rules regarding household
- 2 good carriers?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 4 **MS. STARKS:** And can you give us a brief overview of those?
- 5 **MS. STARKS:** There's several general orders that --
- 6 **MS. BURL:** In relation -- I'm sorry, in relation to this docket.
- 7 **MS. BURL:** In -- to this docket?
- 8 **MS. STARKS:** Yes, ma'am.
- 9 **MS. BURL:** So there are several general orders that have been issued in regards
- to moving companies, and I'm sorry, I don't have the order in front of me, but I
- believe the one that we're referring to is going to be the March 16, 2021 Order,
- which is the last order issued by this Commission in regards to household good
- carriers being registered with the Commission.
- 14 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And are you familiar with the company Adair Movers LLC?
- 15 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 16 **MS. STARKS:** And how did you become familiar with this company?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** This company, we actually received a complaint and an investigation
- in regards to this. And forgive me if I'm not stating it correctly, but I believe that
- 19 it was -- Agent Geter had received a tip or information that this company was
- 20 advertising as a household good mover and she started the investigation and I
- 21 assisted her in that investigation.
- 22 **MS. STARKS:** And for the record, who is Agent Geter?

- MS. BURL: Agent Geter is the previous enforcement agent that worked all the
- 2 complaints at the Commission prior to her retirement in September of 2022.
- 3 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And so she would have gotten that information regarding
- 4 the complaint, correct?
- 5 **MS. BURL:** Correct.
- 6 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Can you turn your attention to what has been previously
- 7 labeled as Staff Exhibit 1, in globo?
- 8 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 9 **MS. STARKS:** Can you tell the court what this document is?
- 10 **MS. BURL:** Yes. These are documents that Agent Geter had given to me that
- showed her investigation, it's some of the documents that she used for her
- investigation. So the first page is the Secretary of State printout that shows Adair's
- Movers LLC was registered with the Louisiana Secretary of State's Office. The
- next page is a copy of their Yelp ad that they claimed to be a mover. That was one
- of the websites that she had investigated. The next page is an updated Yelp printout
- where it shows that this Yelp ad was updated two months prior and it was printed
- on August 8, '22. And then the following page is a continuation of that Yelp page,
- that was five pages long. And then she also reviewed their Facebook ad where
- 19 they were advertising under Facebook and that was a -- it's marked as a seven page
- document but because Facebook printouts are pretty long, we only used the first
- 21 three pages that were relevant to this moving company.
- 22 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And let's go back to the first page, which I believe you
- 23 indicated was the Secretary of State documents, correct?

- 1 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 2 MS. STARKS: Does this document include the name of the company that was
- 3 complained about?
- 4 **MS. BURL:** Yes. The business name is Adair Movers LLC.
- 5 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. What about an address?
- 6 MS. BURL: They have a domicile address at 115 South Upland Avenue in
- 7 Metairie, Louisiana and then a 2029 Dylan Drive, Slidell address as the mailing
- 8 address.
- 9 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And does it have a person as the registered agent or officer?
- 10 **MS. BURL:** They listed their registered agent as the United States Corporation
- Agents, Inc. and the officer of the company as Herman Bernard Adair, IV.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. And if you look at the top left of the page, what does those
- numbers indicate to you?
- 14 **MS. BURL:** The date and time in which this printout was printed, that would be
- 15 January 5, 2022 at 2:44 P.M.
- 16 MS. STARKS: Okay. And how do we know that this is a printout from the
- 17 Secretary of State's office?
- 18 **MS. BURL:** I go to their website and print these very often. We do use these
- printouts. It also has their web address at the bottom and shows that it's Page 1 of
- 20 1.
- 21 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Does it have a seal as well?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** It has the Secretary of State's seal at the top, their logo and seal.

- MS. STARKS: Okay. Thank you. And let's turn to the second page of this
- 2 exhibit. You did reference that the Yelp page was claimed, correct?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 4 MS. STARKS: Does the Yelp page also list -- have a list of services offered by
- 5 this company?
- 6 **MS. BURL:** Yes, it does, midway down the page.
- 7 **MS. STARKS:** And what does that include?
- 8 MS. BURL: Commercial services, furniture moving, large and heavy items
- 9 moving, long-distance moving, furniture assembly, international relocation, local
- moving, packing, unpacking, and crating.
- 11 MS. STARKS: Okay. And the numbers at the top on the left, does that also
- indicate when it was printed?
- 13 **MS. BURL:** Yes. January 26, '22 at 10:02 A.M.
- 14 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And the next page, are the services offered about the same
- as the previous page?
- 16 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 17 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Are there also pictures with people under the photos and
- video section of this page?
- 19 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 20 **MS. STARKS:** And on to that next page where it states about the business. Is
- 21 there a business owner listed here?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Yes, it's listed as Herman A.

- 1 MS. STARKS: Okay. And are there locations -- is their location and hours listed
- 2 on this page as well?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** Yes, midway on the page.
- 4 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Does this Yelp ad also include customer reviews?
- 5 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 6 **MS. STARKS:** And is that seen on the next page?
- 7 **MS. BURL:** Yes, ma'am.
- 8 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And if you turn your attention to the next set of -- after the
- 9 Yelp page, do you have that?
- 10 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 11 **MS. STARKS:** Can you identify that for the court?
- 12 **MS. BURL:** Yes, this is their Facebook page.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. And does it include the company's name as well?
- 14 **MS. BURL:** Yes. Adair Movers.
- 15 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And what about an email address, phone number, a web
- 16 address?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** At the bottom, it indicates the Facebook web address. I guess their
- tag is @adairmovers. It has an email address -- well, it has a website, a GoDaddy
- website, a phone number, and an email address for contacting the company.
- 20 MS. STARKS: Okay. And are there also pictures indicating that these are
- 21 customers or showing off gear that reads Adair Movers?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Yes.

- MS. STARKS: And are there also reviews on this page as well? On the next page,
- 2 I'm sorry.
- 3 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 4 MS. STARKS: Okay. And according to the top right -- I mean left of this
- 5 document, when was it printed?
- 6 **MS. BURL:** January 26, 2022 at 10:01 A.M.
- 7 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And would that be an indication of when the investigation
- 8 was started?
- 9 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 10 MS. STARKS: Okay. Your Honor, at this time, Staff desires to offer, file, and
- introduce into evidence what has been labeled as Staff Exhibit 1, in globo, which
- includes the Secretary of State documents for Adair Movers company -- Adair
- Movers LLC as of January 25, 2022, along with its Yelp advertising page, as well
- as its Facebook advertising page.
- 15 **JUDGE FREY:** Applicant's Exhibit 1, in globo, is admitted.
- 16 **MS. STARKS:** Thank you, Your Honor. And was that information used within
- 17 the investigation to determine if the company violated any rules of the
- 18 Commission?
- 19 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 20 **MS. STARKS:** And after reviewing that information, what was the determination?
- 21 MS. BURL: Agent Geter determined that Adair Movers LLC did not have an
- 22 LPSC number with the Public Service Commission.
- 23 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And as a result, what did she do next?

- 1 MS. BURL: She sent a warning letter to the company indicating that they were
- 2 advertising without having authority from the Commission and that -- she gave
- them instructions on how to register and gave them a deadline to do so.
- 4 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Can you turn your attention to what has been previously
- 5 labeled as Staff Exhibit 2, in globo?
- 6 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 7 **MS. STARKS:** Is this the letter that you were referring to in your testimony, Ms.
- 8 Burl?
- 9 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 10 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And what date is this letter dated for?
- 11 **MS. BURL:** January 26, 2022.
- MS. STARKS: And does it have the company's address as listed in its Secretary
- of State documents?
- 14 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 15 **MS. STARKS:** Is that the mailing address?
- 16 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 17 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And did Ms. Geter give the company a deadline to submit
- that application and the proper fees?
- 19 **MS. BURL:** Yes. February 28, 2022.
- 20 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And did she provide a consequence if that didn't happen?
- 21 **MS. BURL:** Yes, that they would be cited.
- 22 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And is this letter signed by Ms. Geter?
- 23 **MS. BURL:** Yes.

- 1 MS. STARKS: Okay. And to the best of your knowledge, how was this letter
- 2 sent to the --
- 3 **MS. BURL:** It was sent by email to the address that was on the website -- or the
- 4 Facebook page as well as US Postal Mail.
- 5 MS. STARKS: Okay. And for clarity, would that be for email,
- 6 adairmovers2@yahoo.com?
- 7 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 8 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And to the best of your knowledge, was either the email or
- 9 the letter that was sent through mail sent back to the Commission for any reason?
- 10 **MS. BURL:** No.
- 11 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And would that third page indicate the same?
- 12 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. And can you tell the court what that next page is?
- 14 MS. BURL: Yes. This is correspondence between Agent Geter and Mr. Adair
- indicating that they had a conversation on February 22<sup>nd</sup> and that she has spoken to
- her supervisor, myself, concerning a complaint that we had on file and informed
- that he was stating that he was not going to continue to perform household good
- 18 moving. So basically, to sum it up, he was going to stop moving household goods
- and he was willing to sign an affidavit as to such, so she gave him the details of
- 20 that affidavit and asked which he would prefer to do, to stop the moving or did he
- 21 plan to pursue getting authority with the Commission.
- 22 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And did she send that to the same email as to the previous
- 23 letter that you testified to?

- 1 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 2 MS. STARKS: And to the best of your knowledge, was that email sent back as
- 3 undeliverable?
- 4 **MS. BURL:** It was not.
- 5 **MS. STARKS:** And would that second page indicate the same?
- 6 **MS. BURL:** Correct.
- 7 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And what about the last page of this exhibit?
- 8 **MS. BURL:** This is another email sent to Mr. Adair, per another conversation that
- 9 she had. It appears that he had attempted to or was going to file a household good
- application and that we had given him no later than March 30, 2022 to file that
- application and we gave him an overnight address where he could submit the
- application to the Commission. Or if he sent it by regular mail, we also gave him
- our Post Office Box.
- 14 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And to the best of your knowledge, was that email sent
- back as undeliverable as any reason?
- 16 **MS. BURL:** To my knowledge, it was not.
- 17 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Your Honor, at this time Staff desires to offer, file, and
- introduce into evidence what has been labeled as Staff Exhibit 2, in globo, which is
- correspondence from Ms. Derenda Geter to the Adair Movers LLC.
- 20 **JUDGE FREY:** Applicant's Exhibit 2, in globo, is admitted.
- 21 **MS. STARKS:** And Ms. Burl, to the best of your knowledge, did the company --
- JUDGE FREY: I'm sorry, Staff's Exhibit 2, in globo, is admitted.

- 1 MS. STARKS: Thank you, Your Honor. To the best of your knowledge, did the
- 2 company respond in any way?
- 3 MS. BURL: Yes. They submitted an application to the Commission. I believe
- 4 that was submitted around April 5, 2022 to attempt to get authority from the Public
- 5 Service Commission.
- 6 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. It should be in the packet, it might be the last exhibit, Your
- 7 Honor.
- 8 **JUDGE FREY:** I have what looks like this.
- 9 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Thank you. Ms. Burl, can you turn your attention -- it hasn't
- been previously labeled, but it does, at the top of the page, indicate common carrier
- of household goods application. Is this the application that you were referring to in
- 12 your testimony?
- 13 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 14 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And who was it submitted by?
- 15 **MS. BURL:** It was submitted by and signed on Page 2 in front of a notary, Mr.
- 16 Herman Adair.
- 17 MS. STARKS: Okay. And was this application fully accepted by the
- 18 Transportation Division?
- 19 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 20 MS. STARKS: And did it result in Mr. Herman Adair or Adair Movers LLC
- 21 receiving a common carrier certificate?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** No.
- 23 **MS. STARKS:** And why was that?

- MS. BURL: When the application was received, we, as standard practice, we
- 2 typically issue a compliance letter to meet all compliance filings, such as insurance,
- 3 tariffs, registration of vehicles, Secretary of State paperwork. So a compliance
- 4 letter was emailed to Mr. Adair to meet compliance and there were several emails
- 5 that went out. Mr. Adair never met compliance, and therefore this application was
- 6 returned as unprocessed for failure to comply with the requirements of the
- 7 application.
- 8 MS. STARKS: Okay. Your Honor, for housekeeping measures, in this specific
- 9 exhibit, the Social Security number isn't blacked out, but for the court reporter's
- 10 copy, it is.
- 11 **JUDGE FREY:** Thank you for that clarification, Ms. Starks.
- MS. STARKS: Thank you, Your Honor. And Ms. Burl, when was this document
- received by the Commission, according to the stamp at the top?
- 14 **MS. BURL:** April 5, 2022.
- 15 MS. STARKS: Okay. Your Honor, at this time Staff desires to offer, file, and
- introduce into evidence the common carrier of household goods application for
- 17 Adair Movers as Staff Exhibit 3.
- 18 **JUDGE FREY:** Staff's Exhibit 3 is admitted.
- 19 **MS. STARKS:** Thank you. Ms. Burl, can you turn your attention to probably the
- 20 last set of documents that -- I believe. Okay. That's dated April 6, 2022; do you
- 21 have that?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** I have that.
- 23 **MS. STARKS:** Can you tell the court what these documents are?

- MS. BURL: Yes. So this is the original first compliance letter sent to Adair
- 2 Movers LLC noting all of the compliance factors that were needed to issue the
- 3 common carrier certificate, that's a two page letter. Then it's also a copy of what
- 4 we consider a follow-up final compliance letter, indicating that they did not meet
- 5 the first deadline, therefore the remaining things that are still needed to issue the
- 6 common carrier certificate are listed, and it also gives a date for them to comply,
- 7 and that was also sent by email to the email address that we previously had spoke
- 8 of in the communications that Agent Geter had with Mr. Adair. And then the last
- 9 letter, which is also a two page letter, is where we returned the application for
- failing to comply with the requirements to be issued a common carrier certificate.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. Let's go back to the April 6, 2022 letter. The address on
- this letter is different from the address that was on the Secretary of State documents
- from Exhibit 1: is that correct?
- 14 **MS. BURL:** That's correct.
- 15 **MS. STARKS:** Where did this address come from?
- 16 **MS. BURL:** This is the mailing address that they put on their application as well
- as the address that we reviewed on the Secretary of State's website.
- 18 **MS. STARKS:** Okay.
- 19 **MS. BURL:** As the mailing address for the company.
- 20 **MS. STARKS:** Was that an updated Secretary of State?
- 21 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 22 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And regarding that first letter, when was -- was there a
- 23 deadline for that information to be submitted?

- MS. BURL: Yes. The letter that was sent April 6, 2022 gave a deadline to submit
- all of the requirements 30 days from the issuance of this letter, which would have
- 3 been May 6, 2022.
- 4 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And who was this letter sent by?
- 5 **MS. BURL:** This letter was sent by Enforcement Agent Tanza Clark.
- 6 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And does she work under you?
- 7 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 8 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. What about that second letter? Does that have a deadline
- 9 to submit those documents?
- 10 **MS. BURL:** Yes. That letter was sent June 29, 2022, and it gave a deadline of
- July 29, 2022, and it was also signed by Enforcement Agent Tanza Clark.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. And the letter dated August 4, 2022. Does it indicate a
- 13 deadline?
- 14 **MS. BURL:** No, it does not indicate a deadline. It is actually letting the company
- 15 know that attached to this letter was their application that they submitted being
- returned since they did not meet all of the compliance components required, we'd
- 17 listed those once again. The letter also let them know that the application was being
- 18 returned for noncompliance and that their stamps and application fees had been
- forfeited, and that if they wanted to gain authority, they'd be required to resubmit
- 20 the paperwork and the required filings, along with the \$200 application fee and the
- \$10 per vehicle stamp fee, and obtain their LPSC authority. Or if they did not do
- 22 that, they would need to cease all operations as a household good mover, remove

- all Facebook pages and website advertising, and that they could contact myself if
- 2 they had any questions.
- 3 MS. STARKS: And is that -- those Facebook pages and the websites, does that
- 4 indicate advertising?
- 5 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 6 **MS. STARKS:** And does the Commission have a rule regarding advertising with
- 7 household good movers?
- 8 **MS. BURL:** Yes, that is the April 3, 2008 General Order.
- 9 **MS. STARKS:** And what is that rule?
- 10 **MS. BURL:** That order indicates that if a mover is advertising, they must include
- their LPSC Number in any and all advertising, invoices, or estimates that are issued
- by the -- that are created by the company.
- 13 **MS. STARKS:** So that would indicate that if they don't have an LPSC number,
- they can't advertise?
- 15 **MS. BURL:** Correct.
- 16 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Or shouldn't be performing household good moves?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** Correct. And that would go back to the General Order of March 16,
- 18 2021 of not having authority.
- 19 **MS. STARKS:** Would that also coincide with Louisiana Revised Statute Title 45?
- 20 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 21 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Your Honor, Staff desires to offer, file, and introduce into
- 22 evidence what has -- I guess its Staff 4, in globo, which is the correspondence
- between Ms. Tanza Clark and Adair Movers LLC.

- JUDGE FREY: All right. Staff's Exhibit 4, correspondence from Ms. Tanza
- 2 Clark dated April 6, 2022, June 9, 2022, an email of June 29, 2022, and August 4,
- 3 2022 is admitted.
- 4 MS. STARKS: Thank you. And Ms. Burl, after not receiving the compliance
- 5 documents from the company, what did Staff do next?
- 6 **MS. BURL:** Agent Geter was informed that the application was returned. She
- then went back and reviewed their Facebook page, website page, Yelp page. They
- 8 were all still active, so she turned them over to me for a citation.
- 9 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And once you compiled all of that information, what was
- 10 your determination?
- 11 **MS. BURL:** I determined that they were still advertising without having LPSC
- 12 authority and that that was a violation of the Commission's rules and issued a
- 13 citation.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. Can you turn your attention to what was previously labeled
- as Staff Exhibit 3, in globo, which will now be Staff Exhibit 5, in globo? Can you
- tell the court what these documents are?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** Yes. This is a citation issued to Adair Movers LLC on August 18,
- 18 2022. Attached to that was the updated Secretary of State website, as well as the
- letters of January 26<sup>th</sup>, the email of January 26, 2022, the confirmation of delivery
- of the email, the updated -- apologies. The first one was the original Secretary of
- 21 State, the updated Secretary of State, a copy of their personal webpage,
- 22 adairmovers.net, a copy of their adairmovers.net service and pricing page, and that
- was it.

- **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And does the citation indicate what the violation was?
- 2 **MS. BURL:** The violation of Title 45:161 through 180.1 by engaging in activities
- 3 related to moving household goods prior to complying with the requirements of
- 4 Title 45:164(E) and the General Order dated March 16, 2021 and for failure to
- 5 comply with the requirements of General Order dated April 3, 2008 as amended.
- 6 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And the address listed as 3000 Tulane Avenue, Apartment
- 7 455, New Orleans, Louisiana 70119, was that the same address that can be seen
- 8 and that you testified to that's on the updated Secretary of State documents that is
- 9 attached to this citation?
- 10 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. And is that considered, according to their Secretary of State
- documents, as their mailing address?
- 13 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 14 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And did anything else change from that Secretary of State
- document, other than the address?
- 16 **MS. BURL:** From the first printout of the Secretary of State, the only thing that I
- can see that changed is they filed is their Secretary of State annual report. The last
- report filed on the original Secretary of State paperwork was 11/14/2020, and then
- the updated one was a report filed March 22, 2022.
- 20 MS. STARKS: So you could assume that that would be their most current
- 21 information?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Correct. Yes, ma'am.

- 1 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And does the citation provide a date, time, location of the
- 2 hearing for the citation?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** Yes. It was to be held Thursday, November 3, 2022 at 9:30 A.M.
- 4 here at the Public Service Commission, Galvez Building.
- 5 MS. STARKS: Okay. And was this citation published in the Commission's
- 6 Bulletin?
- 7 **MS. BURL:** Yes, on August 19, 2022.
- 8 **MS. STARKS:** And was the citation signed by you?
- 9 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 10 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And is that your signature on the second page?
- 11 **MS. BURL:** Yes, it is.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. Your Honor, at this time Staff desires to offer, file, and
- introduce into evidence what is now Staff Exhibit 5, in globo, the citation issued to
- 14 Adair Movers LLC.
- 15 **JUDGE FREY:** Staff's Exhibit 5, in globo, the citation with attachments, is
- admitted. And if I did not specify that Exhibit 4 was in globo, it is an in globo
- 17 exhibit.
- 18 **MS. STARKS:** Thank you. Ms. Burl, how was this citation sent to Adair Movers
- 19 LLC?
- 20 **MS. BURL:** It was sent by certified mail.
- 21 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And to the best of your knowledge, was that delivered?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Yes.

- 1 MS. STARKS: And did you have any contact with anyone from the company
- 2 afterwards?
- 3 MS. BURL: Yes. After this was issued, Mr. Adair, getting very close to the
- 4 hearing date, I want to say it was somewhere around the 1<sup>st</sup> or the 2<sup>nd</sup>, Mr. Adair
- 5 contacted me and asked if we could continue the hearing, that he wanted to be able
- 6 to have the opportunity to be able to work something out with Staff and apply for
- 7 authority to get his moving LPSC common carrier certificate.
- 8 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And did that happen?
- 9 **MS. BURL:** Yes. We had requested that the hearing be moved to today, May 4,
- 10 2023.
- 11 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Can you turn your attention to the next set of documents?
- 12 What is that?
- 13 **MS. BURL:** That is a copy of the notice for the continuation that was granted in
- this matter to today, with a notation on the bottom from me, along with a copy of
- the citation that was originally mailed.
- 16 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And the continuance was granted, correct?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** Yes, by Judge Frey.
- 18 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And was this document -- is this a copy of the document
- that was sent to the carrier?
- 20 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 21 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And what does it include?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** It includes a copy of the citation that was originally mailed to the
- company back in August of 2022.

- MS. STARKS: Okay. And is there anything that's different regarding the
- 2 attachment from the original citation? Is there anything different within the
- 3 citation?
- 4 **MS. BURL:** I don't think so, no.
- 5 **MS. STARKS:** Okay.
- 6 **MS. STARKS:** Everything is the same
- 7 **MS. STARKS:** And that notation that you testified to, what is that regarding?
- 8 **MS. BURL:** On the bottom of this citation, I made the notation that it was sent by
- 9 FedEx tracking and I indicated a tracking number and it was sent on April 25, 2023.

- 11 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And is that your initials at the bottom as well?
- 12 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 13 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Your Honor, at this time, Staff offer, files, and introduce
- into evidence what is now Exhibit 6, in globo, which is the ruling on the motion to
- 15 continue and notice of rescheduled hearing, with the notation at the bottom by Ms.
- 16 Tammy Burl, sent to the carrier in this docket.
- 17 **JUDGE FREY:** Staff's Exhibit 6, in globo, a copy of the ruling on motion to
- continue and notice of rescheduled hearing date with the original attached citation,
- is admitted.
- 20 **MS. STARKS:** Thank you. And Ms. Burl, you testified that that document was
- 21 sent via FedEx?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Correct.

- 1 MS. STARKS: Did you receive anything back from FedEx regarding delivery of
- 2 that document?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** Yes, I received delivery notification.
- 4 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Can you turn your attention to the next set of exhibits, the
- 5 next set of documents?
- 6 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 7 **MS. STARKS:** Can you tell the court what that is?
- 8 **MS. BURL:** Yes. This is a FedEx printout of the delivery receipt showing that it
- 9 was delivered by A. Herman and a signature on the bottom.
- 10 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Does it have the -- does it indicate that the package was
- delivered to the address on the citation?
- 12 **MS. BURL:** Yes. 300 Tulane Avenue 529 in New Orleans.
- 13 **MS. STARKS:** Is it 300 or 3000?
- 14 **MS. BURL:** 3000, sorry.
- 15 **MS. STARKS:** Thank you. And you did indicate that there was as signature,
- 16 correct?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** Yes, at the bottom of the page.
- 18 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And what are the corresponding pages to this?
- 19 **MS. BURL:** That is the detailed tracking showing its movement through the FedEx
- 20 tracking system up until it was delivered and signed.
- MS. STARKS: Okay. And does that tracking number on that first page ending in
- 22 8093, is that the same tracking number that you indicated at the bottom of that
- 23 notice of rescheduled hearing document?

- 1 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 2 MS. STARKS: Okay. And I'm not sure if you answered to this, but when was it
- delivered, according to this document?
- 4 **MS. BURL:** It was delivered on April 26, 2023.
- 5 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Thank you. Your Honor, at this time, Staff desires to offer,
- 6 file, and introduce into evidence what was previously labeled as Staff Exhibit 5,
- but what is now Staff 7, which is the FedEx tracking information corresponding to
- 8 the ruling on motion to continue and notice of rescheduled hearing, along with the
- 9 original citation sent to the carrier in this docket.
- JUDGE FREY: Staff Exhibit 7 is admitted.
- 11 **MS. STARKS:** Thank you. Ms. Burl, are you aware of any other websites or
- updated Facebook or Yelp pages that the carrier in this docket has?
- 13 **MS. BURL:** Yes. Leading up to preparing for the hearing today, I went back to
- check all the websites that we had previously looked at to see if they were still
- 15 active. The adairmovers.net email was no longer active, which is the very first --
- not email, I'm sorry, website was one of the first websites that we had reviewed
- was no longer active. However, they created a new website, which was adair-
- movers.business.site as well as checking their Facebook page, which had recent
- activity since the last printout investigation back in early 2022.
- 20 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Can you turn your attention to the last set of documents?
- 21 Are these the printouts of the webpages that you just testified to?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 23 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Can you go through the first set of documents for us?

- MS. BURL: So this is the Adair Movers website, this is their first page. The
- second page is a copy of a photo with Adair Movers at the top. And the then the
- third page is their directions to their address, I'm assuming, their phone number, as
- 4 well as their business hours, with a map of their location.
- 5 **MS. STARKS:** Okay.
- 6 **MS. BURL:** And then the second document is their Facebook page, which still
- shows Adair Movers, the adairmovers2@yahoo.com. And when I reviewed that
- page, there were entries in December of 2022. One was a video and then there was
- 9 the Adair Movers posting a advertisement: Looking for a moving company that
- 10 has excellent service, fast a friendly Adair Movers, with a phone number and their
- tag. And then that was a second post, again, on December 16, 2022 with the same
- 12 ad.
- 13 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And would you say that the, I guess, their logo matches on
- both of these webpages?
- 15 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 16 **MS. STARKS:** And what about the dates at the top?
- MS. BURL: The first, their website was reviewed and printed on April 28, 2023,
- and their Facebook page was reviewed and printed this morning, 5/4/2023 at 7:50
- 19 A.M.
- 20 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And are these pictures similar to the ones that are on the
- 21 Yelp page and their previous website page?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Yes. And I did review their Yelp page again and it was still active,
- 23 it just didn't have anything changed from the previous printouts.

- MS. STARKS: Okay. Your Honor, at this time, Staff desires to offer, file, and
- 2 introduce into evidence what was previously labeled as Staff Exhibit 6, which is
- 3 now Staff Exhibit 8, in globo, which is a printout of the Adair Movers website, as
- 4 well as Adair Movers' Facebook page.
- 5 **JUDGE FREY:** Okay. Ms. Starks, I don't think I have what you're referring to
- 6 as a Facebook page printout.
- 7 **MS. STARKS:** Facebook page?
- 8 **JUDGE FREY:** Do you have another copy of that?
- 9 **MS. STARKS:** Yes, Your Honor. Permission to approach?
- 10 **JUDGE FREY:** Yes, ma'am. Thank you, Ms. Starks. Staff Exhibit 8, in globo,
- printouts from Adair Movers, adair-movers.business.site, and Adair Movers'
- 12 Facebook is admitted.
- 13 **MS. STARKS:** Thank you. Ms. Burl, has any representative from Adair Movers
- 14 attempted to contact you or the Transportation Division after the issuance of the
- notice of rescheduled hearing?
- 16 **MS. BURL:** No.

- 17 **MS. STARKS:** What about after you received the FedEx delivery notification?
- 18 **MS. BURL:** No. I had also emailed a copy of the rescheduled hearing and citation
- 19 and tried to reach out to Mr. Adair since we had continued this matter before and
- 20 he was working with us previously. I also tried to call him, but I got no response.
- 21 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. And to that regard, what is Staff seeking in this docket?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Staff is seeking that the carrier be found guilty of violating the
- 23 Revised Statute 45:161 through 180.1 by engaging in those activities related to

- moving household goods prior to complying with 45:164(E) and the General Order
- dated March 16, 2021 and General Order dated April 3, 2008. And that they be
- assessed a fine in the amount of \$1,000 and a \$25 citation fee.
- 4 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. Your Honor, I have no further questions.
- 5 **JUDGE FREY:** Ms. Burl, what is the basis for the fine amount of \$1,000
- 6 requested by the Staff?
- 7 **MS. BURL:** In this case, Your Honor, Staff reached out to the carrier. The carrier
- 8 was wanting to work with the Commission, multiple attempts. We feel that he only
- 9 filed the application to satisfy not being cited, and that based on his knowledge of
- needing to have authority but continuing to advertise and offer moving services,
- even after the citation was issued, would warrant a fine in the amount of \$1,000.
- 12 And I note that has been a fine that has been assessed in the past.
- 13 **JUDGE FREY:** Do you have any specific references to past \$1,000 citations?
- 14 **MS. BURL:** I do not off the top of my head.
- 15 **JUDGE FREY:** All right. I do have a few more questions, Ms. Burl. Do you
- have what has been admitted as Staff's Exhibit 7 in front of you?
- 17 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 18 **JUDGE FREY:** You indicated that there was a signature on the tracking block.
- 19 What does it appear that the letters in the signature capture block?
- 20 **MS. BURL:** It appears to be Herman A.
- 21 **JUDGE FREY:** Okay.
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Or F.

- JUDGE FREY: Does the FedEx tracking indicate that there was a recipient and
- 2 what is that recipient?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** The recipient was Herman Adair, Adair Movers LLC.
- 4 **JUDGE FREY:** Okay. Do you have what has been marked as and admitted as
- 5 Staff Exhibit 6, in globo, in front of you?
- 6 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 7 **JUDGE FREY:** Does the in re in the notice on the ruling on motion match the in
- 8 re that is on the citation?
- 9 **MS. BURL:** It does not.
- JUDGE FREY: All right. But the citation was attached to this notice and sent to
- the carrier; is that correct?
- 12 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 13 **JUDGE FREY:** May I please refer you to Staff Exhibit 5, in globo.
- 14 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 15 **JUDGE FREY:** You referenced updated Secretary of State documents. What is
- the date on what you're referring to as updated, for the Secretary of State
- 17 documents?
- 18 **MS. BURL:** 8/17/2022.
- 19 **JUDGE FREY:** And you also referenced updated website printouts. What is the
- 20 date of the website printouts that are part of that exhibit?
- 21 **MS. BURL:** 8/17/22 is the adairmovers.net website that was printed.
- 22 **JUDGE FREY:** Thank you. And -- sorry, did you have additional testimony?

- MS. BURL: The second document, which was the adairmovers.net, which was
- the service policy, it also was dated August 17, 2022.
- 3 **JUDGE FREY:** Thank you, Ms. Burl. Earlier in your testimony, in reference to
- 4 the Yelp page, you indicated that the Yelp page was claimed. Could you explain
- 5 what that means?
- 6 **MS. BURL:** So during our investigations and our research, while we're investing
- these ads that we find, I will go in and find out what claimed means. So when Yelp
- 8 grabs a company's information and puts in on the website, typically it is not
- 9 claimed. It gives the person that is actually that company the opportunity to claim
- 10 it. Once they've claimed the website, it changes from unclaimed to claimed, and
- then that's when information is then update -- they can update it and edit it as they
- would like to. So this Yelp page shows that it was claimed right underneath the
- company's name. There's three stars and then it's noted that it's claimed. And on
- the second page that was printed out on August 8, 2022, during the process of
- issuing this citation, it's still marked that it was claimed and that it had been updated
- two months prior to this printing.
- 17 **JUDGE FREY:** Okay. You mentioned that Ms. Geter either received a complaint
- or a tip. Do you know which it was, Ms. Burl?
- 19 **MS. BURL:** My recollection, it was just someone indicating, and I do not know
- who it is because it was not an email, but someone had purportedly called her to
- 21 say that they saw their advertising, and I'm going to assume that was another
- 22 regulated entity.

- JUDGE FREY: Regardless of whether it was a complaint or tip, is Staff's
- 2 investigation into the matter the same?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** Yes
- 4 **JUDGE FREY:** Let me go through my notes, make sure I've asked all the
- 5 questions that I had in mind. Ms. Burl, with regard to the remedy Staff is seeking
- 6 in this matter, you referenced the fact that they were advertising and had continued
- to do so. Can I reference to you to what was admitted as Staff's Exhibit 4, in globo,
- and the correspondence dated August 4, 2022?
- 9 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 10 **JUDGE FREY:** And on the last page. Does it ask them to submit an application
- or cease operations a household good mover?
- 12 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 13 **JUDGE FREY:** So during the course of the investigation, was Adair Movers ever
- told that they had to cease operations, then seek authority? What is the Staff's
- position on that?
- 16 **MS. BURL:** I'm sorry. Can you say that again?
- 17 **JUDGE FREY:** So I'm asking -- the Staff was aware through the course of the
- investigation that they were holding themselves out or appeared to hold themselves
- out, is Staff's position they were holding themselves out as a household goods
- 20 mover without authority; is that correct?
- 21 **MS. BURL:** Yes.
- 22 **JUDGE FREY:** Was there ever any cease and desist issued advising them to cease
- 23 operations prior to receiving authority or seek authority or cease operations?

- 1 MS. BURL: Other than conversations that Agent Geter had, I don't believe it was
- 2 in her initial letter.
- 3 **JUDGE FREY:** Okay. And with regard to what Staff's seeking today, is -- Staff
- 4 is seeking that they be found guilty and that they be fined \$1,000, and pay a citation
- 5 fee; is that correct.
- 6 **MS. BURL:** That's correct.
- 7 **JUDGE FREY:** All right. I have no further questions. Do you have any redirect,
- 8 Ms. Starks?
- 9 **REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. TANIKA STARKS**
- 10 **MS. STARKS:** Yes, Your Honor. Just one question.
- 11 **JUDGE FREY:** Thank you.
- MS. STARKS: Ms. Burl, when a carrier is given a warning letter, are they -- does
- 13 Staff suggest -- or require them to cease operations before getting that common
- 14 carrier certificate?
- 15 **MS. BURL:** We -- the first sentence of the letter that we give them says that
- pursuant to 45E, no motor carrier shall operate as a common carrier without having
- 17 first obtained from the Commission a certificate. So with that statement, Staff feels
- like that tells them they don't have a certificate, so therefore they should not be
- operating or advertising.
- 20 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. So it's implied that they should cease operations and apply,
- or just cease operations?
- 22 **MS. BURL:** Correct.

- MS. STARKS: Okay. And does it offer a consequence if they do neither or
- 2 continue to operate without that authority?
- 3 **MS. BURL:** Yes. The consequence would be to issue a citation.
- 4 **MS. STARKS:** Okay. No further questions, Your Honor.
- 5 **JUDGE FREY:** All right. Thank you, Ms. Starks. I have nothing further. You
- 6 can step down, Ms. Burl. Ms. Starks.
- 7 MS. STARKS: Yes, Your Honor. In closing, Staff submits that it has borne its
- 8 burden of proving through both documentary and testimonial evidence that the
- 9 company cited in this matter, Adair Movers LLC, violated Louisiana Revised
- Statute 45:161 through 1801.1 by engaging in activities related to moving
- 11 household goods prior to complying with requirements of Louisiana Revised
- 12 Statute 45:164(E) and General Order dated March 16, 2021 and for failure to
- comply with the requirements of General Order dated April 3, 2008 as amended.
- 14 As Ms. Burl indicated, the company has been advertising with their Facebook
- pages, Yelp pages, website pages. They've been in contact with the Commission
- regarding that advertising without having that LPSC authorization. They attempted
- to remedy it and then they went black on us with no communication at all. And as
- in that regard, Your Honor, Staff is going to seek that the company be found guilty
- of all those violations as well as a \$1,000 fine be assessed as well as a citation fee
- of \$500 be assessed to the company -- \$25, I'm sorry.
- 21 **JUDGE FREY:** And what is Staff's position with regard to the advertising that
- 22 you discovered is being done or alleges being done.
- 23 **MS. STARKS:** I'm sorry, Your Honor, what -- can you restate your question?

- JUDGE FREY: Does Staff have any position with regard to the advertising that
- 2 Staff alleges is out there on the internet [INAUDIBLE].
- 3 **MS. STARKS:** Oh, Your Honor, we would request that they be ordered to remove
- 4 all advertising, up until such they receive a common carrier certificate from the
- 5 Louisiana Public Service Commission.
- 6 **JUDGE FREY:** All right. Thank you, Ms. Starks. Is there anything further from
- 7 the Staff in this matter?
- 8 **MS. STARKS:** No, Your Honor.
- 9 **JUDGE FREY:** All right. Thank you. If there is nothing further, this matter is
- 10 adjourned.

11

13 (WHEREUPON, THE HEARING WAS ADJOURNED)

| 1  | I hereby certify that the foregoing pages 1 through 33 are true and correct to the best |                            |
|----|---|----------------------------|
| 2  | of my knowledge of the Hearing held on May 4, 2023                                      | in Baton Rouge, Louisiana. |
| 3  |   |                            |
| 4  | Rough Draft by:   |                            |
| 5  | Kayla Fiorenza  | May 4, 2023                |
| 6  | Kayla Fiorenza,   | Date                       |
| 7  | Court Reporter  |                            |
| 8  | Proofed by:   |                            |
| 9  | Harling Orfres  | May 16, 2023               |
| 10 | Kathy Dykes,  | Date                       |
| 11 | Court Reporter  |                            |
| 12 | Finalized by:   |                            |

14

15

Kayla Fiorenza,

**Court Reporter** 

May 17, 2023

Date